



PORTSTORONTO

BILLY BISHOP TORONTO CITY AIRPORT

**NOISE MANAGEMENT SUB-COMMITTEE
MEETING #19**

MEETING MINUTES

May 15, 2024
6:30 PM to 8:00 PM
Zoom Online Meeting
Toronto, Ontario

Minutes prepared by:





These meeting minutes were prepared by LURA Consulting. LURA provides neutral third-party consultation services for the Ports Toronto Noise Management Sub-Committee. These minutes are not intended to provide verbatim accounts of committee discussions. Rather, they summarize and document the key points made during the discussions, as well as the outcomes and actions arising from the committee meetings. If you have any questions or comments regarding the Meeting Minutes, please contact either:

Angela Homewood
Environmental Project Manager
Billy Bishop Airport
PortsToronto
AHomewood@portstoronto.com

OR

Geoffrey Mosher
Meeting Facilitator
LURA Consulting
Phone: 416-206-2454
gmosher@lura.ca



Summary of Action Items from Meeting #19

Action Item	Action Item Task	Who is Responsible for Action Item
M#19-A1	PortsToronto and Ms. Homewood will inquire with RJ Burnside and Akoustik if information related to the data collection process can be included in the appendix of the Ground Noise Study.	PortsToronto
M#19-A2	Mr. Meneses will forward comments and suggestions for improving the noise report to the PortsToronto communications team.	PortsToronto
M#19-A3	Mr. Meneses will send Ms. Monette (BQNA) information and mitigation strategies in place regarding changes to the helicopter staging direction.	PortsToronto
M#19-A4	PortsToronto will inquire about comments and suggestions for improving the complaint form on the PortsToronto website	PortsToronto
M#19-A5	Mr. MacWilliam will inquire about other noise monitor types that can be plugged into the system and update the committee at the next meeting.	PortsToronto
M#19-A6	Mr. Meneses will inquire with Porter about the revving plan engines and direction of exhaust to find a mitigation strategy.	PortsToronto
M#19-A7	Ms. Homewood will remind the RJ Burnside team about the action items from the last NMSC meeting regarding the Ground Noise Study	PortsToronto

List of Attendees

Name	Organization (if any)	Attendance
COMMITTEE MEMBERS		
Hal Beck	York Quay Neighbourhood Association	Present
Max Moore	Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association	Present
Lesley Monette	Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association	Present
Jay Paleja	City of Toronto – Waterfront Secretariat	Present
PORTS TORONTO REPRESENTATIVES		
Angela Homewood	PortsToronto	Present
Michael MacWilliam	PortsToronto	Present
Noah Meneses	PortsToronto	Present
FACILITATION		
Geoffrey Mosher – Lead Facilitator	LURA Consulting	Present
Hasnaa Maher – Notetaker	LURA Consulting	Present
GUESTS		
Denise Soueidan-O'Leary	LURA Consulting	Present

1.	Agenda Review and Action Item Review	4
2.	Ground Noise Study Update	4
3.	Annual Noise Report	7
4.	Permanent Noise Management Terminal Update	10
5.	Business Arising	10

Appendices:

[Appendix A: Meeting Agenda](#)

1. Agenda Review and Action Item Review

Geoffrey Mosher (LURA Consulting) welcomed attendees to the 19th Noise Management Subcommittee (NMSC) meeting, which was held virtually via Zoom. Mr. Mosher then introduced the committee members to new project team members, Denise Soueidan-O'Leary (LURA Consulting) and Hasnaa Maher (LURA Consulting).

Mr. Mosher provided an overview of the agenda items and asked if the committee had additional items to add. The meeting agenda is included in **Appendix A**.

Mr. Mosher notes that there are no outstanding actions from the last meeting.

2. Ground Noise Study Update

Angela Homewood (PortsToronto) provided an update on the Ground Noise Study. Ms. Homewood began the verbal update by stating that she asked the RJ Burnside team for an update on the work to inform this presentation. She provided background information on the Ground Noise Study, informing the group that it was started in 2019-2020 by RJ Burnside and Akoustik, per its recommendation from the 2018 Airport Master Plan. Ms. Homewood continued to explain that, during the time of the RFP's release, all interested consultants attended the NMSC to engage with the community, resulting in positive dialogue about airport operations' impacts on the community in relation to noise. This meeting included RJ Burnside before they eventually won the proposal to do the Ground Noise Study.

Key points from Ms. Homewood's update were:

Comments, questions, and responses are listed as sub-bullets.

- Due to the pandemic and the suspension of commercial operations, the study was pending until services resumed.
- Temporary noise monitoring terminals were installed at suitable locations in the neighborhoods where Max Moore (BQNA) and Lesley Monette (BQNA) are located.
- In January of last year, the Airport's Vice President sent a letter to the community, soliciting locations for installing terminals, but there were not enough locations identified. In October of that same year, the same request was sent by email to the Noise Management Sub-Committee members, gaining responses from Lesley Monette (BQNA) and Max Moore (BQNA), resulting in the installation of monitors on their buildings.
- Initially, a seven (7) day noise monitoring setup was planned, but this was extended to ten (10) days per Max Moore's (BQNA) request.
- The Akoustik consulting team was responsible for data-gathering and sending results on the impacts of airport operations and specific survey questions to Michael MacWilliam's team for review.
- Tasks currently underway include an internal review of the data sources received and information provided by Micheal MacWilliam's team and its application to the model.
- Over 30 noise sources were identified based on community suggestions and anticipated noise sources, such as diesel generators. The team is correlating this

data, identifying mitigation measures for noise impacts, and exploring additional mitigation opportunities.

- In mid-February, data from Max Moore (BQNA) and Lesley Monette (BQNA) were received and reviewed for accuracy before sharing it with the consultants.
 - Hal Beck (YQNA) requested elaboration on why the Port Authority was involved with the data collection and not the consultants directly.
 - Ms. Homewood clarified that they had to conduct an operational study, not only data gathering. Therefore, they had to collect information such as how often the grass is cut, considering different aspects have specific outputs. The consultants would be unable to gather this information due to the task being time-consuming. Instead, data was gathered from maintenance and operational staff.
 - Michael MacWilliam (PortsToronto) added that they wanted to ensure the accuracy and confidence in the data. This involved a lot of effort, including contacting many stakeholders and eventually compiling 30 spreadsheets. There is a detailed list indicating the height of the source, hour by hour, and a map of every noise output on the island. An example given was the garbage collection noise output. Mr. MacWilliam acknowledged that most residents' complaints concern garbage collection regarding its timing.
 - Mr. Beck (YQNA) thanked Mr. MacWilliam for his time and thoughtfulness. He then inquired if the spreadsheets can be included in the appendix of this meeting's minutes.
 - Ms. Homewood responded that she has only seen a draft of the table of contents, therefore pointing Mr. Beck (YQNA) to make this request to RJ Burnside and Akoustik at the Noise Management Subcommittee meeting in June.
 - Jay Paleja (City of Toronto) asked if the report will be ready for the June 26th meeting. Ms. Homewood confirms that the team is on track for this.
 - Mr. Paleja (City of Toronto) requested that the process of collecting this data be shared in the Study's appendix to acknowledge community complaints and provide transparency.

M#19-A1 PortsToronto and Ms. Homewood will inquire with RJ Burnside and Akoustik if information related to the data collection process can be included in the appendix of the Ground Noise Study.

- Max Moore (BQNA) asked for DBA and DBC noise comparisons to be included in the report.
- Mr. Beck (YQNA) seconded this request and noted the importance of seeing these noise measurements broken down by the octave bands. He stated that this would be crucial for the community to better understand the source of these deep base frequencies that cause vibration.

- Lesley Monette (BQNA) echoed these sentiments as well, asking if the duration of the intensity of the noise is going to be measured.
- Mr. Beck (YQNA) seconded Ms. Monnette's (BQNA) request, stating that this data must be measured for accurate projection. He emphasized that the duration of noise events and the peak duration are separate issues that must be considered.
- Angela Homewood explained that RJ Burnside went through the 10 days of data that was gathered from the mobile noise monitoring terminals and tried to correlate it with some of the spreadsheet data. This is already a complex task to undertake, requiring hourly data breakdown.
- Mr. Beck (YQNA) made a note of the conventional ferries that woke him up between 5:00 to 6:00 am four (4) to five (5) times a week upon their return from the island. He emphasizes the need to document both noise event duration and peak noise duration, using idling Q400s as an example.
 - During the meeting, Mr. Paleja (City of Toronto) included the last [NMSC meeting minutes](#) from October 25th in the Zoom chat. They include some of RJ Burnside's responses to these questions on pages 5 to 7.
- Noah Meneses (PortsToronto) noted the use of various programs and tools to measure noise for this specific study, confirming the study includes both noise event duration and peak duration.
- Mr. Moore (BQNA) asked Mr. Meneses if these noise reports are documented in DBA or DBZ - or both.
- Mr. Meneses responded, stating that they are reported in DBA; however, he noted that DB was mostly identified, with no specification.
- Mr. Moore (BQNA) expressed concern with this and expanded on the importance of transitioning to reporting in DBZ decibels to ensure more accurate noise reporting. He explained that DBA only reports half of the noise because it does not report the base noise.
- Mr. Meneses responded that DBZ was confirmed for the noise study but not to transition the noise monitoring software that the Airport uses daily.
- Mr. Beck (YQNA) noted that reporting is also done in PNL (Perceived Noise Levels), DBA, DBZ, and DBC.
- Mr. MacWilliams noted that no other airport has needed DBZ reporting before. Mr. Moore (YQNA) states that this is because most airports have a large enough ground buffer, preventing ground noise from being a factor. Reporting in DMZ becomes crucial for the island airport due to its proximity to residences that are being impacted by this base noise.
- Mr. Beck (YQNA) highlighted that there are no standards for actual infield monitoring of airports.

- Ms. Homewood responds that this is because the regulatory regime is historically DBA-based, which NMSC community members have identified as a problem. Therefore, the Ground Noise Study will address this and provide some insight into what should be done moving forward.
- Mr. Moore (BQNA) rearticulated that measuring in DBA is historical and started as a way to compare airplanes with one another. This measurement method has remained on the books because of its convenient precedent. However, the next step should be to move forward with DBZ to have more accurate noise reports about ground noise.
- Mr. Beck (YQNA) expressed interest in having a presentation about the octave bands and PNLT to inform the community and address all city-wide concerns about noise.
- Ms. Monette (BQNA) asked if any studies have been done on humans about the impact that sound over the duration of 24 hours has on their wellbeing. She noted that continuous and long-lasting noise increases annoyance, which is different from noise loudness.
- Mr. MacWilliam responded by acknowledging that these complaints have been received a lot.
- Mr. Beck (BQNA) suggested there be a community champion on this topic and that historically, Ms. Monette (BQNA) has expressed a lot of interest in studying health issues surrounding noise.
- Ms. Monette (BQNA) stated that she has a strong interest in the topic and will continue to research it.

3. Annual Noise Report

Noah Meneses (PortsToronto) provided a presentation on the [2023 Annual Noise Summary Report](#). Mr. Meneses noted that the report was published on the PortsToronto website in February of this year. He also highlighted that the website has been recently redesigned to improve readability and functionality.

Key points from Mr. Meneses' presentation were:

Comments, questions, and responses are listed as sub-bullets.

- The Airport has been in operation for 85 years now, supporting the city with transportation, tourism, healthcare, and employment.
- 2023 was a year full of growth and recovery in many ways. 74% of movements and packs returned since the Covid-19 pandemic. Orange, the main medevac operator at the Airport, conducted 2764 operations in 2023.
- In 2023, there were 308 complaints, compared to 2022, which got 376 complaints. Therefore, there has been an 18% overall decrease in complaints since 2022. The report also compares the data collected over 10 years, discovering that 2023 was the fourth lowest year of receiving complaints since 2013. Technically, there were 290 complaints made in 2023 because 18 out of the 308 overall complaints were not caused by the Airport and instead were a

result of city construction and street traffic. 73% of those 290 complaints were received from four (4) community members from the top two (2) locations, BQNA and YQNA, about aircraft activity.

- The community plays a very significant role in identifying the noise disturbances, which later inform the different policies, procedures, and mitigations that PortsToronto puts into effect to try and reduce them as much as possible.
- The Noise Management Sub Committee met twice last year, and the CLC met four times.
- Examples of community-driven initiatives include Nieuport's implementation of electric buses this year, the mitigation of ferry noise, and adjustments to helicopter staging and aircraft landing hours.
- The community has also influenced website improvements, such as reporting structure, file locations, and Web Tracks. PortsToronto has met with Web Tracks to address community feedback regarding time delays, and they are working on enhancing information visibility and adding additional radar sets from external sources, not just NAV Canada.
- In 2023, Mr. Meneses conducted multiple site visits during different peak hours of the day to experience the noise effects firsthand. He communicates that he is committed to listening to everybody's concerns and encourages the community to continue reporting issues and attending meetings.
 - Mr. Moore (BQNA) thanked Mr. Meneses for the presentation and comments on the ferry ramp noise. He noted that although action was taken and improvement was made, there is still noise there that wakes him up at 5:30 in the morning. Mr. Moore (YQNA) has gone out to measure the noise at this time and found it to be between 90 to 95 DBZ decibels. He highlights that it has likely decreased to about 80 decibels now, which means that the sound has been cut by half – signifying significant improvement.
 - Mr. MacWilliam responded by saying that he also goes out around that time in the morning and has observed that the noise is related to how the bus drives across the ramp. If the driver takes their time across the flap, then no noise will be emitted. He has reached out to the shuttle bus operator to remind drivers to mitigate this disturbance.
 - Mr. Paleja (City of Toronto) provided some comments related to improvements that can be made to the noise report. This includes having an annual comparison of complaints by activity and aircraft type, emphasizing the need for a 10-year baseline and monthly activity comparisons. He also recommended detailing mitigation efforts and their correlation to specific complaints.
 - Mr. Meneses agreed to forward these comments to the PortsToronto communications team for next year's report.

M#19-A2 Mr. Meneses will forward comments and suggestions for improving the noise report to the PortsToronto communications team.

- Mr. Beck (YQNA) suggested enhancing the website's complaint form by connecting it to the content and data being reported in the annual report.
- Mr. Paleja (City of Toronto) added that the complaint form should be easier to find and that the dropdowns should be in plain language.
- Mr. Meneses agreed that fewer and smaller items in the dropdowns would make the website more user-friendly.
- Mr. Beck (YQNA) commented on the report's title, stating that he would like it to be renamed from Annual Noise Management Report to Annual Noise Complaints Report.
- Ms. Homewood acknowledged that Mr. Beck had made this request in previous meetings. She noted that this report is part of the noise management program, which looks at everything the airport does regarding reporting or collecting. Ms. Homewood stated that program management reviews will be happening with the new senior management, Robert Asaa, who will be supporting Mr. MacWilliams and Mr. Meneses in this regard.
- Mr. Moore (BQNA) suggested keeping the report title as is and letting the content grow into its name.
- Ms. Monette (BQNA) asked Mr. Meneses for information and mitigation strategies in place regarding changes to the helicopter staging direction because she is still receiving noise complaints from BQNA residents.

M#19-A3 Mr. Meneses will send Ms. Monette (BQNA) information and mitigation strategies in place regarding changes to the helicopter staging direction.

- Ms. Monette (BQNA) also highlighted the difficulty of inputting complaints on the website. She noted that submitting complaints, especially several times a day, is time-consuming due to the need to type one's address, name, phone number, and other information each time. Therefore, residents often submit one report, however, on several different and unrelated complaints. Ms. Monette expressed concern about how this affects the record of complaints received, considering the total number and category of actual noise events can be inaccurate using this template.
- Mr. Moore seconded Ms. Monette's complaint, stating that the complaints form is user-unfriendly.
- Mr. Mosher responded that this feedback had been noted before and that this will be taken into consideration to see if any adjustments can be made to be further discussed in future meetings.
- Mr. MacWilliam and Mr. Meneses acknowledged Ms. Monette's (BQNA) and Mr. Moore's (BQNA) comments about the complaint form and will look into improving this.

M#19-A4 PortsToronto will inquire about comments and suggestions for improving the complaint form on the PortsToronto website.

4. Permanent Noise Management Terminal Update

Michael MacWilliam (PortsToronto) provided an update on the Noise Management Terminal.

Key points from Mr. MacWilliam's update were:

Comments, questions, and responses are listed as sub-bullets.

- The annual noise management terminal maintenance was done a month ago.
- The request to move the noise monitoring site from the terminal building on the mainland ferry to the washroom could not be made. The proposed location does not meet the objective of monitoring at the window level, and the company does not support a wall installation. Mr. MacWilliams recommended that the noise monitor remain on the roof of the mainland PTF (Passenger Terminal Facility), where it currently is.

M#19-A5 Mr. MacWilliam will inquire about other noise monitor types that can be integrated into the existing system and update the committee at the next meeting.

- Ontario Place construction is causing intermittent power outages, affecting noise monitoring data. However, Mr. MacWilliam is working closely with the Ontario Place manager to remain well informed on the times of the power shutdowns.
 - Ms. Monette (BQNA) noted that she was at the Harbourfront and noticed jet-appearing planes taking off from west to east, causing a loud echo through the buildings. She then inquired why there was no monitor for YQNA and if the neighborhood was concerned about noise in that area.
 - Mr. MacWilliam indicated no prior community requests to install noise monitors in that area. He noted that the aircraft in question is the MU2 operated by Thunder Air for patient transport.

5. Business Arising

Geoffrey Mosher (LURA) began the discussion of Business Arising topics.

- Mr. Mosher announced that the next noise management sub-committee meeting has been scheduled for June 26th, 2024, in person at the Radisson Blu Downtown Toronto (249 Queens Quay). There is also a tentative meeting scheduled for some time in July.
- Ms. Homewood added that there might be a conflict for July 17th, but she will make sure to confirm everyone's attendance. She noted that this meeting is crucial as it will cover the report back from the Ground Noise Study consultants, providing an opportunity for questions from the community before finalizing the report. A draft will be presented at the June 26th meeting, allowing the members to review before attending the July meeting.
- Ms. Homewood explained that the meeting had been booked with the Radisson Blu due to limited hours at the Waterfront Neighbourhood during their summer registration period.
- Ms. Monette (BQNA) inquired about a comment from the last meeting regarding revving plane engines and offered to send pictures to help identify the direction of the exhaust in hopes of finding a mitigation strategy.

- Mr. Meneses agreed to review this complaint with Porter.

M#19-A6 Mr. Meneses will inquire with Porter about the revving plane engines and direction of exhaust to find a mitigation strategy.

- Mr. Paleja (City of Toronto) notes action items related to the Ground Noise Study from the last meeting that should be addressed at the next meeting with the consultants.
- Ms. Homewood confirmed that these action items were sent to the RJ Burnside team in November and agreed it would be a good idea to remind them.

M#19-A7 Ms. Homewood will remind the RJ Burnside team about the action items from the last NMSC meeting regarding the Ground Noise Study.

The meeting adjourned at 8:00 PM.

Appendix A

Meeting Agenda

Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Noise Sub Committee Meeting 19

Wednesday May 15, 2024

6:30 PM to 8:00 PM

Zoom Virtual Meeting

AGENDA ITEMS

6:30 Welcome

6:35 Agenda and Action Item Review

6:40 Ground Noise Study Update (Angela Homewood)

7:20 Annual Noise Report (Noah Meneses)

7:30 Permanent Noise Management Terminal Update (Michael MacWilliam)

7:45 Business Arising

- Next meeting June 26th, 2024, 6:30-8:00 PM (In-Person)

8:00 Adjourn